

## ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

6 SEPTEMBER 2016

Present: County Councillor Mitchell(Chairperson)  
County Councillors Aubrey, Clark, Hill-John, Lomax, White and  
Darren Williams

### 15 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillors Chris Davis and Bob Derbyshire.

### 16 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

### 17 : MINUTES

The minutes of the Committee meetings held on 12 June 2016 and 14 July 2016 were approved as correct record and were signed by the Chairperson.

### 18 : CITY OPERATIONS DIRECTORATE - QUARTER 1 PERFORMANCE REPORT 2016/17

The Committee received the City Operations Directorate performance report for Quarter 1 of 2016/17. The report provided a summary of overall Council performance, for example, staff budgets, overtime and agency costs, sickness rates and complaint levels. Members were asked to consider the performance data and provide observations to support the Cabinet's consideration of the Quarter 1 performance report.

Members were advised that in January 2016 the WAO Corporate Assessment Follow-on Report had stressed the importance of the Council building on its capacity and mechanisms for internal challenge and self-assessment. In response, the Council acknowledged that there is a need for more consistency around performance management and benchmarking. The Head of Performance and Partnerships was tasked with refreshing the Council's performance management approach. The Quarter 1 Performance Report was presented in a different format. The new structure includes sections relevant to the Directorate on:

- Measures – this focussing on performance indicators
- Priorities – setting out objectives, commitments and progress/issues/mitigating options against Corporate Plan objectives
- Challenges and Achievement – this sets out the key challenges and achievement of the City Operations Directorate

The new design dovetailed with the Council new integrated Strategic Planning Framework. The Strategic Planning Framework was approved by the Council on 25 February 2016. It set out 4 priorities and 12 improvement objectives for the authority. The 4 priorities are:

- Priority 1: Better education and skills for all
- Priority 2: Supporting vulnerable people

- Priority 3: Creating more and better paid jobs
- Priority 4: Working together to transform services

The report also referenced the role played by the Performance Support Board to support service performance; the improved reporting timelines and the publishing of performance information on the Internet. The report also included a summary of the key issues identified in the City Operations Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17.

### *City Operations Aspects*

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Ramesh Patel, Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning and Sustainability; Andrew Gregory, Corporate Director and Matt Wakelam, Head of Infrastructure and Operations. The officers were invited to deliver a presentation on the City Operations aspects of the Quarter 1 Performance Report.

The Chairperson thanked the officers for their presentation. Members were asked to comment, raised questions or seek clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members stated that there has been some improvement to the 'street scene' following changes within the directorate relating to the management of Enforcement/Education/Waste Management. Members noted that Waste Collections were not included and asked whether there were any plans to include Waste Collections in the revised arrangements in the future. Officers acknowledged the point and recognised the issue. Officers considered that the services were 'two parts or a whole'. The Cabinet Member considered that it was crucial that these services work together.
- Members commended the impressive figures presented relating to responses to reports of fly-tipping. The Committee considered that it would be useful to be made aware of any trends identified relating specifically to the reporting of fly-tipping.
- Members asked officers to clarify what the phrase 'high profile cleansing outcomes' meant. Officers stated that the phrase means a total cleanse of the entire street scene; litter pick-up, gully clearing, sign cleaning, etc – so that the street scene is left in the best possible conditions. The authority wishes to promote ownership of neighbourhoods and would, in future, seek to engage and mobilise local communities.
- The Committee noted that of the Directorate's 17 Performance Indicators, 5 were yet to be validated. Members considered that (rather than receive no information) it would be more useful to have been given an indication of the results for the PIs, albeit with a caveat that the results were yet to be validated.
- Members asked whether any analysis of the impact of 'Brexit' upon the Council had been undertaken. The Cabinet Member stated that Brexit was an issue for all local authorities. A Cabinet Report on this issue would be brought forward in the near future.
- The Committee was asked to note that the Strategy Development Policy requires that 10 local authorities in the region agree their priorities, including transportation

and environmental issues, by 2021. The Cabinet Member advised that he wished to encourage all authorities within the region to follow Cardiff's lead in terms of a 50/50 modal split for transportation.

- Referring to Performance Indicator PLA004(a), Members asked what comparisons or benchmarking had been undertaken with other local authorities. Officers stated that it was unclear whether there were any differences in the way these figures are calculated across local authorities. The Cabinet Member considered that it was important to highlight that Cardiff, as capital city, is dealing with numbers of planning application far in excess of our neighbours and therefore has greater pressures. It was the duty of Welsh Government to recognise this.

### *Commercial and Collaboration Aspects*

The Chairperson welcomed Tara King and Jane Cherrington to the meeting. The officers were invited to deliver a presentation on the Environment aspects of the City Operations Quarter 1 2016/17 Performance Report.

The Chairperson thanked the officers for their presentation. Members were asked to comment, raised questions or seek clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- The Committee raised concerns regarding the collection of waste from private residences by commercial contractors that is not sorted. Members asked what could be done to encourage private contractors to recycle. Officers stated that there is a statutory duty to collect from private residences, but where residents don't recycle there can often be complex issues. The authority works with some management agencies in order to resolve this issue. However, some management agencies are not keen to comply, so there is a lack of consistency. Officers accepted that this issue remains a challenge for the service and can affect recycling performance due to the large numbers of such residences in the City. Officers considered that management companies need to be made aware that they can reduce their costs if residents recycle more.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee's behalf to the Cabinet Member to convey their comments and observations.

## 19 : THE CITY OF CARDIFF - DRAFT 2016 AIR QUALITY PROGRESS REPORT

The Committee received a report on the Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.

Members were advised that the authority is responsible to monitoring and reviewing air quality standards in Cardiff. This responsibility is delegated to the Council through a number of regulations and pieces of legislation. The Environment Act 1995 introduced legislation for the local management of air quality and introduced a statutory duty for local authorities to review and assess the air quality within their boundaries and to monitor local air quality in comparison with health based standards and objectives. The National Air Quality Strategy, published in March 1997,

established standards for eight key pollutants and outlined national and international policies to reduce air pollution levels by 2025. The National Air Quality Strategy was revised and republished as 'The Air Quality Strategy for England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland – Working Together for Clean Air'.

Additionally, the Air Quality (Wales) Regulations 2000 set statutory objectives for local authorities based on the effect of pollutants on human health. The main pollutants of concern are particulate matter, oxides of nitrogen and ground level ozone and ammonia. The key sources for these pollutants are road transport, fuel burning plants such as power stations and agriculture. Members were advised that the economic cost from the impact of air pollution in the UK is estimated to be between £9 billion and £19 billion per year. Poor air quality is often associated with traffic derived pollution. Urban areas close to busy roads are susceptible to exceeding the health-based standards for Nitrogen Dioxide and Particulate Matter.

It is estimated that air pollution reduces life expectancy in the UK by an average of six months. Particulate Matter (PM) consists of microscopically small solid particles or liquid droplets suspended in the air and it is closely associated with effects on health. The World Health Organisation advises that there is no safe exposure level to PM and for people with heart and lung conditions elevations in PM can worsen their symptoms. High concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> can also cause irritations of the lungs and can exacerbate existing lung conditions including asthma.

The City of Cardiff – 2016 Draft Air Quality Progress Report will assist the authority to fulfil the requirements of the Local Air Quality Management (LAQM) process. The LAQM process places an obligation on all local authorities to regularly review and determine whether air quality objectives are likely to be achieved. Where air pollution targets are exceeded the local authority must declare an Air Quality Management Area (AQMA) and prepare an Air Quality Action Plan setting out the measures it intends to put in place in order to address air quality issues.

The report identified four areas in Cardiff where AQMA have been established, namely:

- Cardiff City Centre
- Stephenson Court
- Ely Bridge
- Llandaff

The report summarised the City of Cardiff – 2016 Draft Air Quality Progress Report main findings and future proposed actions.

The Chairperson welcomed Helen Picton, Operational Manager Enterprise and Specialist Services and Jason Bale - Team Manager (Environment) from the Joint Regulatory Service to the meeting. The officers were invited to deliver a presentation on the City of Cardiff – 2016 Draft Air Quality Progress Report.

Members of the Committee were asked to comment, raise questions or seek further clarification on the issues raised. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked to what extent Pollution Control were engaged with under the planning application process. Members were advised that the service had made representations during the LDP consultation process and they were also statutory

consultees for large planning development applications. Air quality assessments of larger developments are required.

- Members raised concerns regarding the cumulative effect of larger developments on air quality. A Member commented that developers assume that new application will have no detrimental effect on air quality in areas where problems already exist. Officers stated that developers are asked to consider the cumulative effect of large developments on air quality. Developers engage with professional air quality consultants during the planning stage. Pollution Control officers will challenge the developers and their consultants on a case by case basis. Where appropriate, s106 funding will be sought so that additional air quality monitoring can be undertaken.
- Members noted that concerns had been expressed regarding the design of the new bus station and in particular air quality issues arising in the atrium roof space. Officers confirmed that the air quality assessment for the new bus station will be considered by officers of the Council. Discussions are taking place with the developers regarding measures that may mitigate any air quality problems arising, such limiting the use of the bus station to electric or hybrid vehicles only.
- Officers were asked to clarify the measure in place in Westgate Street to reduce concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub>. Officers stated that measurements have indicated that air quality assessments are failing in Westgate Street and other parts of the City Centre. The authority was seeking to reduce traffic flows and use priority bus lanes. An action plan will be put in place and monitoring will indicate whether there is any improvement. The use of hybrid buses and increasing the number of charging points available for electric vehicles in the City Centre were also being considered.
- Members asked whether the authority was investigating the possibility of 'real-time' air quality monitoring and whether we would ever be in a position to respond to spikes in particulates by managing traffic accordingly. Officers indicated that Newport Council were installing monitoring devices were would enable 'cloud based' air quality monitoring data to be made publicly available. Officers would liaise with colleagues in Newport but at present any move to such technology in Cardiff was aspirational.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee's behalf to the Cabinet Member to convey their comments and observations.

20 : CARDIFF COUNCIL PUBLIC CONVENIENCE OUTLINE STRATEGY 2016

The Committee received a report on the Cardiff Council Public Convenience Strategy 2016. Members were asked to consider the Strategy and provide feedback prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.

Members were advised that the Welsh Government had declined to adopt the Public Health (Wales) Bill. However, Cardiff Council has continued with its commitment towards public convenience provision in the City, including the establishment of a Strategy to address the toileting needs of the community; improving both the standards and the availability of public conveniences under the local authority's

control. To address this commitment the Council had established the 'Cardiff Council Public Convenience Strategy 2016'.

The Strategy sets out the authority's key concerns regarding the provision of public conveniences, these include:

- The various partnership approaches which can be taken in the provision of public conveniences
- The adoption of best practice
- The use of new technologies
- How access to public conveniences will be communicated in the future

The Strategy also sets out a series of recommendations which need to be considered prior to any formal timetable of plans is established. The aim is to provide good quality public conveniences for all residents and visitors. The Strategy sets out a 17 areas for consideration, and these are followed up with a number of recommendations for each area. The list of considerations and recommendations were contained within the report at Appendix 1. The report also contained a summary most important considerations identified by the Strategy and described what each consideration aims to achieve.

The Committee welcomed Matt Wakelam, Head of Infrastructure and Operations and Rob Gravelle, Section Leader, Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic and Transportation to the meeting. The officers were invited to deliver a brief presentation on the Cardiff Council Public Convenience Strategy 2016.

Members of the Committee were asked to comment, raise questions or seek further clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked what public conveniences were available in the City Centre for elderly and disabled people in the late evening. Officers stated that there were currently insufficient numbers of facilities and provision after 10.00pm was particularly poor. The new transport interchange will include toileting facilities but there were still opportunities to improve provision further. High standard public conveniences are available at the St David's 2 Centre and are accessible after 10.00pm. The authority was aiming to provide similar high standard facilities at the transport interchange.
- Officers advised that the Council budget for the provision of public conveniences is zero. The Council intends, through the Strategy, to be a facilitator, providing information/signposting to members of the public about toileting facilities in the city, such as via the use of existing mobile phone apps.
- The Committee asked what plans were in place for the former public toilet buildings owned by the authority. Members were advised that some buildings are listed. The Strategic Estates department currently have responsibility for these buildings. It was anticipated that, with zero budget available, the reopening of those buildings is highly unlikely.
- Members asked whether any work had been done to assess the needs in terms of public convenience provision and whether, once there is an understanding of

public demand, a case for resources could be developed. Officers reiterated that there was no budget available and the priority at present was to signpost service users to available facilities.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee’s behalf to the Cabinet Member to convey their comments and observations.

21 : DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME  
2016/17

The Committee AGREED the Work Programme for 2016/17.

22 : CORRESPONDENCE

The Committee received copies of correspondence sent and received in relation to matters previously scrutinised by this Committee.

23 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Members were advised that the next Environment Scrutiny Committee is scheduled for 4 October 2016.

The meeting terminated at 8.00 pm

***This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg***